

MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF REDRESSAL GRIEVANCE COMMITTEE

(To settle the issue in [Cotton Products (Gauze & Bandages) A044] Tender for Surgical Disposable Items 2020-21)

A meeting of the Grievance Committee constituted vide letter No. PC/57448-54 /MH., Dated 14-09-2020 held on 11.11.2020 at 10:00 a.m. in the office of Chairman Grievance Redressal Committee, Mayo Hospital Lahore to decide grievance received from following bidders, to settle the issue of against the Advertisement Tender (Surgical Disposable Item) duly advertised vide No. PC/48029/MH., Dated 21.07.2020 Opened on 15.08.2020 for the year 2020-21.

The committee decided as under:-

Sr.No.	Grievance	Status of TEC	Proceeding of Redressal of Grievance Committee / Decision
01	<p>M/s Finetex Cotton Industries vide their letter No. FCI/049-20, dated 22.10.2020 bearing Diary No.17358, Dated 22.10.2020 stated that: Dear Sir, We are the Manufacturing of Surgical Dressing Items and participated in your Tender process about Tender Code A-044 (Cotton Gauze and Bandages 2020-21). According to your Evaluation Report your Technical Evaluation Committee declare us Not Responsive against Product No. 01 (Surgical Gauze Roll BPC) in sample evaluation but my above mentioned product is according to the specification so it is humbly request to you please accept my grievance so that we can explain our position in this regard. We shall be thankful to you</p>	<p>Responsive except T.E # 1. The bid is Responsive in all quoted items except T.E # 1 due to failure in Part C.</p>	<p>Mr. Waheed Akhter attended the meeting on behalf of M/S Finetex Cotton Industries. The representative was asked to describe his grievance. The committee evaluated the matter and it is revealed that said is disqualified by the end user in terms of quality. After due deliberation and discussion, the committee decided to uphold the decision of T.E.C. Hence grievance is rejected.</p>
01	<p>M/s M/s Essity Pakistan Ltd vide their letter No. MHL/854/FS/sh, dated 23.10.2020 bearing Diary No.17399, Dated 23.10.2020 stated that: Respected Sir, With reference to your evaluation report for the tender Code A044 (Cotton</p>	<p>The bid is responsive in all quoted items except T.E # 4 due to failure in Part A & 7 Non Responsive in Part C.</p>	<p>Mr. Jameel Haider (Manager Sales & Marketing) attended the meeting on behalf of M/S Essity Pakistan. The</p>

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

[Handwritten signature]

Product, bandage etc.), we noticed that "samples rejected due to poor quality" for below detail along their tender serial numbers. 4 & 7.
 We would like to inform you that we **M/s Essity Pakistan Limited (Formerly BSN Medical)** have been supplying these products in Pakistan's major government hospital since decades.

Sir it is stated that we are supplying (Gypsona) Plaster of Paris Sr. 7 to your good institution since many year (orders and award contract letter attached).
 For your ready reference, we have enclosed some purchase order of Sr. 4, and 7 from different institutions of Pakistan especially Punjab region.
 It is requested to you kindly allow us to re-submit samples for re-evaluation purpose and relevant documents. Looking forward to see your support & equitable decision.

Tender Sr.No	Tender Item	Offered Brand
4	Absorbent Gauze Swabs 10 cm x 10cm USP-IV (Pack of 100 Swabs) (Pack)	Propex Combine Dressing 10 cm x 10 cm
7	Plaster of Paris Bandages BPC Roll 20 cm x 6m *Gypsona Bandages 6")	

We are hopefully looking forward for your kind consideration.

M/s M/s A. Rehman Corporation vide their letter No. AR-20/786, dated 23.10.2020 bearing Diary No.17372, Dated 23.10.2020 stated that:

Sir,
 Our firm had submitted tender for Surgical Guaze for the year 2020-21 vide code # A044. In this connection, the evaluation committee has announced our sample as Non responsive.

It is requested that the provided sample of Surgical Guaze is a Drug Item, vide tender's terms & Condition
 "Special condition of the Contract Agreement section # Technical specification & ancillary services

The bid is Non Responsive in all quoted items due to failure in Part C.

representative was asked to describe his grievance.
 The committee scrutinized the matter and conclude the following findings.

For **T.E 7** Plaster Of Paris, the committee decided to re-evaluate the samples in accordance to standard specifications that are **15cm * 2.7 m** and not 20cm * 6m which were mistakenly typed.

Final decision for TE 7 will be made by TEC after re-checking of samples on standard size.

For **TE 4** decision of TEC will be upheld

Hence the grievance for TE 7, is accepted but for TE 4, grievance is rejected.

Mr. M. Iqbal (Proprieter) did not attend the meeting within given due time on behalf of M/s A. Rehman Corporation. However he met the chairman and the members separately in the office on the same day.

He had been given fair chance to describe his grievance. The committee evaluated the Technical evaluated

<p>(E) Testing / verification procedure" After delivery of drug & medicines at the purchaser's premises, the purchaser's shells send the samples from each batch to Drug Testing Laboratories, Punjab for testing. The inspection committee constituted by the purchaser shall inspect the quality, specification of goods after receipt of standard quality report from DTL concerned as per Law. The cost of the lab tests shall be borne by the suppliers. Sir, according to the terms and conditions of the tender, the said item of surgical gauze which has various parameters can only be analyzing by the Drug Testing Laboratory Lahore. Furthermore, our firm has already been supplying the same brand of some manufacturer Hafiz Pharma Industry for annual tender for the year 2019-20 and also using in Mayo Hospital as yet. Sir, the batch of provided sample to evaluation committee 2020-21, is already declared standard by the DTL, Lahore. So keeping in the view of the above our sample of Surgical Gauze is standard quality which is manufactured with full parameters according to Drug Act, 1976. There is also need for healthy competition for welfare of hospital patients. Kindly / sympathetically review our humble request.</p>		<p>Performa and it is revealed that the said item at T.E 1 Absorbent Surgical Gauze was being rejected in PART C (End User discretion). After due deliberation and detailed discussion, the Committee unanimously decided to uphold the decision of T.E.C. Hence the grievance is rejected.</p>
<p>M/s M/s Cotton Craft (Pvt) Ltd vide their letter No.786/1278/2020, dated 23.10.2020 bearing Diary No.17403, Dated 24.10.2020 stated that: Dear Sir, We M/s Cotton Craft (Pvt) Ltd. Manufacturers surgical dressing items / Medical Devices would like to submit our grievance against technical evaluation report No. 532/CH Store/ MH dated 8th October 2020 for the supply of surgical disposable items / Medical Devices (Cotton Products, Gauze, Bandages etc) for the financial year 2020-2021. We observed / point out from the technical evaluation report that the bid of our firm has been responsive except T.E 2,4 and 7 due to failure in Part C which is not understandable. In this regard we would like to inform we are only Prequalified Firm in the director General Health Services Punjab since 2015 to onward and the Last Year of Prequalification Notification No. 8276-90 dated 03.10.2019 (Copy Enclosed for your ready reference).</p>	<p>Responsive except T.E # 2,4,7. The bid is responsive in all quoted items except T.E # 4 due to failure in Part A & T.E # 2,4,7 Non Responsive in Part C.</p>	<p>Mr. Tanveer attended the meeting on behalf of M/S Cotton Craft. The representative was asked to describe his grievance. The committee scrutinized the matter and conclude the following findings. For <u>T.E 7</u> Plaster Of Paris, the committee decided to re-evaluate the samples in accordance to standard specifications that are <u>15cm * 2.7 m</u> and not 20cm * 6m which were mistakenly typed. Final decision for TE 7 will be made by TEC after re-checking of samples on</p>

Further stated that we supplied the Item No 2 Absorbent Cotton Wool BPC Roll of 500gm and Item No.7 Plaster of Paris Bandages 15cm x 2.70Mtr in all District Health Authorities (DHAs) Punjab as well as Pakistan Defense Force and No One sample of these two items has been declared as Spurious of Substandard from Last Several Year. We are one against submitting here with samples for evaluation please re-evaluate the samples and qualified it.
 Keeping in view you are requested to kindly please look this issue on merit and revise the technical evaluation report accordingly and make as responsive in all items for the supply of Mayo Hospital Lahore with a reasonable price for which we shall be highly obliged.

M/s Medicare Enterprises vide their letter No. Nil, dated Nil bearing Diary No.17368, Dated 23.10.2020 stated that:
 Respected Sir,

Reference to your cited subject letter No. PC/532, regarding disqualification of our firm during initial scrutiny for Tender Item No. 1 Surgical Gauze BPC And item No# 2 Absorbent Cotton Wool.

We hereby give our serial wise grievance / submissions as under;

1. Our product is approved as per DRAP slandered product and meets all the requirement of the health Care Providers.
2. Our said items is according to BPC slandered as we are supplying this item last year in your institute and many other Government institutions as well.
 - (1) Mayo Hospital Lahore
 - (2) DHQ Rawalpindi
 - (3) Holy Family Hospital Rawalpindi
 - (4) Sheikh Zaid Hospital Lahore
 - (5) Mian Munshi Hospital Lahore
3. We have not done any business with your institution since last eight years so there in no question of poor past experience.
4. Our manufacture in the only one who carrying the license of medical devices in Pakistan (Attached Copy)

It is therefore, requested to kindly re-evaluate/recheck our products and gives

standard size.
 For **TE 2 and 4** it is unanimously decided to uphold the decision of TEC.

Hence the grievance for TE 7, is accepted but for TE 2 and 4, grievance is rejected.

Mr. Abdul Rauf (CEO) attended the meeting on behalf of M/S Medicare Enterprises. The representative was asked to describe his grievance. The committee evaluated the matter.

After due deliberation and discussion, the committee decided to **uphold** the decision of T.E.C.
 Hence grievance is **rejected**.

Responsive except T.E # 1&2.
 The Bid is Responsive in all quoted items except T.E # 1 & 2 due to failure in Part C.

an opportunity to participate in the bid for better competition and provision of fine quality items.



18/11/2020

Sadia Arshad Rana

Member Grievance Redressal Committee



Dr. Muhammad Iqbal
Additional Medical Superintendent
Member Grievance Redressal Committee


Raafia Fatima
Hospital Pharmacist
Copt, Member Grievance Committee



Prof. Dr. Ameer Afzal
Head of North Surgical Ward
Chairman Grievance Redressal Committee