MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING



MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

Participants:

1. Prof. Dr. Ahsan Numan
Head of Neurology Department Mayo Hospital Lahore

Chairman

2. Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary Member
Head of Ophthalmology Department Unit-II Mayo Hospital Lahore

3. Dr. Sohail Arshad Member

Addl. Directors Stores Mayo Hospital Lahore
4. Mr. Azeem Butt Member

Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore

5. Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti
Deputy Brugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore

Proceedings:

Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairman, Grievances Committee Mayo Hospital Lahore welcomed all the participants.

ITEM NO. 01:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S ABDUL SHAKOOR CHAUDHARY & CO. (TENDER CODE: CONTRACT FOR TRAFFIC CONTROL & PARKING)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted the grievance while stating that M/S Abdul Shakoor Chaudhary & Co, is a government approved contractor company established under the umbrella of 'Chaudhary Group' with hands-on experience of more than 20 years in the field of Parking Area Management, E-Ticketing, RFID Card parking system, Face Recognition Terminal, Automated Parking, Parking Software and Smart Parking Solution across Punjab with Government, Semi Government and Autonomous departments. The firm alleged that the TEC did not give Marks of SECP Certificate and also deducted marks of Technical Staff Certificates despite the fact that the firm had attached their Certificates with technical bid. The firm claimed to have attached copies of certificates with this letter.

Decision:

Mr. Imran Yousaf, Manager of firm pleaded the case of firm before the grievances committee. The committee observed that Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC) has disqualified bid in section 10 of Part-A due to non-provision of SECP Registration Certificate. The firm provided SECP Certificate

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore

06-09-2023

Page 1 of 4

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING



MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

No. 0135686 issued on 26th June 2019. The committee decided to declare firm responsive in Section 10 of Part-A.

ITEM NO. 02:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S BASHIR BROTHERS (TENDER CODE: CONTRACT FOR TRAFFIC CONTROL & PARKING)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted the grievance M/S Bashir Brothers has some objections on the Technical Evaluation Reports. The firm claimed that it attached Audit report of last two years for which 20 marks were not awarded. Furthermore, 10 marks were not awarded for Technical staff, Project Manager IT. Technical staff, Project Manager IT. Firm added that under 'Experience of E-Ticketing System', out of a total of 10 ticketing experience already running at Mayo Hospital under E-Ticketing, the firm has not been given 10 marks while the rest of the companies have been awarded good marks.

Grievance against M/S Chaudhary Abdul Shakoor Co.

The firm claimed that M/S Chaudhary Abdul Shakoor's Company, which was shareholder in 5 canteens of hospital, has been awarded 32.5 marks while the tenders of this company's canteens did not have bank statements of 15 million and 0 marks shall be marked. The firm also challenged the 20 marks of financial statement to be rechecked. There is a bank account in the name of Chaudhary Abdul Shakoor company, the statement of this account has already been filed with the canteens and the bank does not and cannot change any kind of bank statement frequently, so the statement of the canteens. Considering the statement made in the tender, the numbers should be removed from the technical bid. The PEC and the company do not have any original traffic ticket of SECP. All the documents of Chaudhary Abdul Shakoor's company should be checked. The firm alleged that company has failed from Part-A which is mandatory parameters and cannot be included in grievance. The firm also stated that any kind of deficiently in essential foods is not accepted, so this firm should be declared as a failure.

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore 06-09-2023

Page 2 of 4

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING



MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

Decision:

Mr. Khuram Mehmood pleaded the case of firm before the grievances committee. The committee observed that Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC) has disqualified bid due to failure in Part-B. The firm claimed 20 marks in section 5 of Part-B. The firm provided Audit Report for the year 2021 & 2022 before the grievances committee issued by M/S Malik Gul Muhammad Awan & Co issued in favor of M/S Bashir Brothers without date of issuance. The committee observed that the firm has attached same Audit Report issued in favor of Mr. Shahzad Qayyum that showed gross disparity in submitted documents. The committee unanimously turned down the grievance to the extent of section 5. The firm further claimed 5 marks in section 3 while stating that the firm has hired Project Manager IT. The committee observed that the firm has mentioned Mr. Sabir Ali as IT Engineer but failed to show any appointment letter and degree in Computer Science/ IT. The firm has mentioned Mr. Majid Sohail as Mechanical Engineer whereas his degree is in Energy & Environmental Engineering and the appointment letter was also missing. The committee also turned down grievance in this section. The firm then claimed 10 marks in section 1 of Part-B. The firm showed contract agreement with Mayo Hospital Lahore whereas Installation of E-Ticketing has been mentioned in agreement. Issued on 9 Nov 2020. The committee awarded 5 marks in section 1 of Part-B. However, the firm remains nonresponsive in part-B due to less marks 50 out of 100.

Grievance against M/S Abdul Shakoor Ch. & Co.

Mr. Imran Yousaf, Manager defended the case on behalf of M/S Abdul Shakoor Ch. & Co. The petitioner alleged that the defendant does not have sufficient financial statement to be awarded 15 marks. The committee observed that the defendant has Net Revenue Rs. 30,959,440 in its FBR statement 2021-22. The petitioner claim regarding SECP was also turned down as the firm holds SECP Certificate No. 0135686 issued on 26th June 2019.

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore 06-09-2023

11 [

Page 3 of 4



MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

The committee decided to turn down grievance against M/S Abdul Shakoor Ch. & Co.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and by the Chair.

Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti

100

2 27

Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Sohail Arshad Addl. Director Stores Mayo Hospital Lahore Mr. Azeem Butt

Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore

Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary

HoD Ophthalmology Department

Mayo Hospital Lahore

Upload

Prof. Dr. Ahsan Numan

HoD Neurology Department

Mayo Hospital Lahore

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore 06-09-2023

Page 4 of 4

