MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

Venue: Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore
Date & Time: 24-07-2023

Participants:

1.	**Prof. Dr. Ahsan Numan** Head of Neurology Department Mayo Hospital Lahore	**Chairman**
2.	**Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary** Head of Ophthalmology Department Unit-II Mayo Hospital Lahore	**Member**
3.	**Dr. Sohail Arshad** *Addl. Directors Stores Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
4.	**Mr. Azeem Butt** *Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
5.	**Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti** *Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**

Proceedings:

Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairman, Grievances Committee Mayo Hospital Lahore welcomed all the participants.

ITEM NO. 03:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S EASTERN MEDICAL CARE (TENDER CODE: A013. SURGICAL DISPOSABLES)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted following grievance with reference to the tender of Surgical items. The reservations regarding the quoted items are given below:

S.N.	Item Name	Reason of Rejection	Remarks
14, 15, 16,	Surgical Gloves Latex Sterile (6.5, 7.0, 7.5 & 8.0) & Powered	Rejection due to ISO 10282 is not mentioned on label of product.	The quoted brand is world leading brand; registered from DRAP under registration no. **MDIR-0004918.** Firm undertakes that its quoted gloves meet the international standards of ISO 10282. Declaration of same from Principal is enclosed for record. Further it may also be verified from Quality Assurance Certificate issued from plant (COA). However the firm undertakes that supply will be made with

			the updated label as demanded by the hospital with ISO 10282.

The firm requested to re-evaluate on the same grounds for the fair and healthy competition.

Decision:

Mr. Qasim Khan, Sales Executive of firm pleaded the case of firm before the grievances committee. The firm's representative stated that the quoted brand qualifies all the requirements of tender. The committee observed that Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid in section 8 of Part-A & Part-C with the comments that ISO 10282 is not mentioned on the label of the product. The advertised specifications states that "sterile single pack glove pair with/ without powder and thickness as per ISO 10282. Pack Size 50 pair per pack". **The committee observed that the thickness of quoted samples shall be evaluated on the basis of standard mentioned in ISO 10282 rather than indication of same on product label. The committee decided to refer back case to Technical Evaluation Committee to evaluate the sample of T.E. 14, 15, 16 & 17 as per advertised specifications.**

ITEM NO. 04:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S MEDICARE ENTERPRISES (TENDER CODE: A013. SURGICAL DISPOSABLES)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted following grievance with reference to the Technical Evaluation Report. The firm stated that has been declared "dis-qualified" in Surgical Gloves Sr no: 14, 15, 16, and 17 by the Technical Evaluation Committee with remarks "ISO 10282 is not mentioned on label of product".

The firm claims that it complies with all the parameters mentioned in the bidding document, and all the requisite documents are already attached to the bid. The quoted brand Ansell GAMMEX is world famous brand and are attaching bio-compatibility report as per ISO 10282. The firm requested to review document and reconsider the decision. The firm added that, as per bidding document technical criteria compulsory parameter Part A Sr no 7: The bidder shall provide the Pakistan Embassy attested Free Sale Certificate of the product bearing the brand name of the product in the country of Manufacturer. The firm claimed that it has quoted Surgical Gloves Sr no:14, 15,16,17 with the brand name PERFECT, and as per its knowledge the valid

free sale certificate of the quoted brand (Perfect) is not attested by the Embassy. The firm requested to scrutinize the documents of the bid accordingly and reconsider the decision.

Decision:

Mr. Shoaib Inayatullah, Institutional Sales Officer of firm pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The firm's representative stated that the quoted brand meets all the requirements of tender. The committee observed that Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid in section 4, 8 of Part-A & Part-C with the comments that ISO 10282 is not mentioned on the label of the product.

The firm's representative states that it has attached MDR certificate No. MDR 763361 issued in favor of Ansell Lanka (Pvt) Limited valid up to 04.01.2028 issued by BSI (The British Standards Institution). The same was also verified form the BSI website. **The committee decided to declare T.E. 14, 15, 16, 17 responsive in section 4 of Part-A Compulsory Parameters.**

The committee also discussed that advertised specifications of T.E. 14, 15, 16, 17 states that "sterile single pack glove pair with/ without powder and thickness as per ISO 10282. Pack Size 50 pair per pack". **The committee observed that the thickness of quoted samples shall be evaluated on the basis of standard mentioned in ISO 10282 rather than indication of same on product label. The committee decided to refer back case to Technical Evaluation Committee to evaluate the sample of T.E. 14, 15, 16 & 17 as per advertised specifications.**

Grievance against M/S Mediserve

Mr. Agha defended the case on behalf of M/S Mediserve. The petitioner stated that M/S Mediserve's valid Free Sale Certificate is not attested by the Embassy of Pakistan as required under section 7 of Part-A Compulsory Parameters. The defendant admitted that his Valid Free Sale Certificate is not attested by Embassy of Pakistan and presented a Press Release No. 53/2023 issued by Ministry of Foreign Affairs. The committee observed that the objection raised by M/S Medicare are tenable as the defendant does not fulfill the requirements of section 7 Part-A **and declared T.E. 14, 15, 16, 17 quoted by M/S Mediserve non-responsive in Part-A.**

ITEM NO. 05:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S ADNAN TRADERS (TENDER CODE: A013. SURGICAL DISPOSABLES)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted following grievance with reference to Technical Evaluation Report .The firm stated that it has been declared "Non Responsive" in I.V Cannula SR No: 08,09,10,11 with remarks that required Specification are not mentioned on label of product, and Surgical Gloves SR No: 14, 15, 16, 17 with remarks "ISO 10282 is not mentioned on label of product". The firm claims that it complies with all the parameters mentioned in the bidding document, and all the requisite documents are already attached with the bid. The firm claims to attach documents showing detailed product specifications of I.V Cannula SR No 08,09,10,11. The firm has also claimed to attach Bio-compatibility report as per ISO 10282, for surgical gloves SR No 14, 15, 16, 17. The firm added that it has provided the documents by manufacturer, endorsing that the surgical gloves are according to the ISO 10282. The firm requested to review document and reconsider the decision.

Decision:

Mr. Waqas Habib, Proprietor of firm pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The firm stated that Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified T.E. 8, 9, 10, 11, 14, 15, 16, 17 due to failure in Part-A & Part-C.

The firm's representative presented Product Specifications containing sizes & codes used in IV Cannulas. The committee observed that TEC has disqualified T.E. 8, 9, 10, 11 with comments that specifications are not mentioned on the label. The firm's representative provided a document of Final Product Specifications. **The committee decided to refer T.E. 8, 9, 10, 11 to TEC to evaluate samples on the basis of specifications provided by the bidder.**

The committee also discussed that advertised specifications of T.E. 14, 15, 16, 17 states that "sterile single pack glove pair with/ without powder and thickness as per ISO 10282. Pack Size 50 pair per pack". **The committee observed that the thickness of quoted samples shall be evaluated on the basis of standard mentioned in ISO 10282 rather than indication of same on product label. The committee decided to refer back case to Technical Evaluation Committee to evaluate the sample of T.E. 14, 15, 16 & 17 as per advertised specifications.**

ITEM NO. 06: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S THE SEARLE COMPANY LTD. (TENDER CODE: A013. SURGICAL DISPOSABLES)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that it has been declared non-responsive for items No. 14, 15, 16, and 17, which pertain to Sterile Surgical Gloves sizes 6.5, 7.0, 7.5, and 8.0 respectively. The reason provided for our non-responsive status was the non-availability of ISO 10282 on the label of quoted product.

The firm claimed that it has commendable track record in supplying institutional surgical goods, such as I.V Cannula and Surgical Gloves, to various renowned organizations. The products meet the highest quality standards and are manufactured in compliance with all relevant regulations. Regarding the specific concern raised about ISO 10282, the firm assured that its surgical gloves conform to the required standards. While the ISO 10282 information may not have been explicitly mentioned on the product label, the gloves themselves meet the specified criteria. The firm acknowledged that ISO 10282 primarily outlines sampling protocols for the production of surgical gloves. It is essential to note that its products are manufactured under stringent quality control specifications that far surpass the requirements of ISO 10282. The firm added that it sources gloves from TG Medical, the world's leading gloves manufacturer based in Malaysia, and is renowned for exceptional quality standards. The firm has raised the point that ISO has withdrawn the certificate back in Sep, 2002 but still it is considering this standard as key standard for evaluation of the product instead of other superlative quality standards. The firm claimed that it products adhere to internationally recognized quality standards FDA registered, ISO EN 455, ASTM D3577, and ISO 10993-1. These standards guarantee the safety, performance, and biocompatibility of its gloves. The firm aims to provide superior protection and reliability to healthcare professionals and patients alike.

The firm referred to Technical Evaluation Committee (TEC) report and mentioned some challenges in gathering bidder-specific data especially obtaining comprehensive information about the bids submitted by various participants. The lack of clarity in the report makes it challenging for it to identify which bidder quoted which specific product. This information is

crucial for it to assess the competitive activity accurately and make necessary improvements in our future bids.

Grievance against M/S Mediservce

The firm requested to reevaluate the bid of Mediserve, specifically considering the mandatory requirement of providing a Free Sales Certificate with the quoted brand mentioned. The firm requested to verify if the quoted brand name PERFECT is mentioned on Free sales certificate.

Grievance against Clifton Enterprises

The firm claimed that M/S Clifton Enterprises quoted the brand name "Medipro" in bid, and it has also come to knowledge of petitioner that they were declared nonresponsive in another tender at Lahore General Hospital, Lahore, due to the provision of forged purchase orders. Grievance report of Lahore General Hospital is also attached for reference. The firm claims to take these concerns very seriously and highlight such issues. The firm requested to conduct a thorough reevaluation of M/S Clifton Enterprises' technical bid and additionally, verify the authenticity of the purchase orders provided.

The firm appreciated the commitment to fair play for all participants in the tender process and value the opportunity to highlight this issue and request a reconsideration of its nonresponsive status for items No. 14, 15, 16, and 17.

The firm reiterated to provide any additional documentation or information required to support its compliance with the specified standards and looked forward to favorable response and the chance to continue its valued partnership with this esteemed hospital.

Decision: Mr. Ahmed Iqbal, Senior Regional Manager pleaded the case of firm before the grievances committee. The committee observed that Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid in section 8 of Part-A & Part-C with the comments that ISO 10282 is not mentioned on the label of the product. The advertised specifications states that "sterile single pack glove pair with/ without powder and thickness as per ISO 10282. Pack Size 50 pair per pack". **The committee observed that the thickness of quoted samples shall be evaluated on the basis of standard mentioned in ISO 10282 rather than indication of same on product label. The committee decided to refer back**

case to Technical Evaluation Committee to evaluate the sample of T.E. 14, 15, 16 & 17 as per advertised specifications.

Grievance Against M/S Mediserve

The decision has been taken in Item No. 4 in grievance submitted by M/S Medicare against M/S Mediserve.

Grievance Against M/S Clifton Enterprises

Mr. Qasim Mehmood, Sales Manager & Mr. Ammar, CEO defended the case of M/S Clifton Enterprises. The petitioner claimed that M/S Clifton Enterprises submitted forged documents in Lahore General Hospital Lahore and was declared non-responsive after verification by the grievances committee. He further stated that the firm has submitted purchase orders of New Mehmood Pharmacy that are fake. He further supported his claim by claiming that M/S Clifton Enterprises did not import quoted brand MediPro during that period. He claimed that M/S Clifton Enterprises had been importing another brand in the past and the same has been supplied by the defendant in previous financial year at Mayo hospital Lahore. The defendant stated that the firm has imported 2.5 lac pairs of MediPro in the year 2018 but could not provide import documents during the grievances committee. The committee prorogued the meeting the next day with the directions to defendant to bring necessary documents to support its stance. Mr. Ammar, CEO of Clifton Enterprises appeared before the grievance committee and stated that previously they were not importer of MediPro brand and worked as distributor. The Head Office of New Mehmood Pharmacy verified the purchase orders through Mr. Zaman Manager. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has already declared firm responsive after carrying out necessary requirements and decided to turn down the grievance against M/S Clifton Enterprises.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and by the Chair.

Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Mr. Azeem Butt
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Sohail Arshad
Addl. Director Stores
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary
HoD Ophthalmology Department
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Prof. Dr. Ahsan Numan
HoD Neurology Department
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Item 03 to 06 may be uploaded

08/08/23