

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



Participants:

- | | |
|---|----------|
| 1. Prof. Dr. Ahsan Numan
Head of Neurology Department Mayo Hospital Lahore | Chairman |
| 2. Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary
Head of Ophthalmology Department Unit-II Mayo Hospital Lahore | Member |
| 3. Dr. Sohail Arshad
Addl. Directors Stores Mayo Hospital Lahore | Member |
| 4. Mr. Azeem Butt
Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore | Member |
| 5. Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti
Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore | Member |

Proceedings:

Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairman, Grievances Committee Mayo Hospital Lahore welcomed all the participants.

ITEM NO. 01: GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S ALLIED & CO.(TENDER FOR CONTRACT OF NURSING HOSTEL CANTEEN & EYE WARD CANTEEN)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to technical report that M/s Chaudhary Brothers & M/s Safdar Ali and Brothers are responsive. The firm referred to the Punjab Procurement Rules 2014 amended chapter VI (opening evaluation and rejection of bids), its subsection 33 clarifications of paid part 1 that, 'No bidder shall be allowed to alter or modify his bid after the closing time for the submission of bids. Part 3 states that any request for clarification in the bid made by the procuring agency and its response shall invariably be in written. He added that as per bidding documents, the eligibility criteria part A mandatory parameter serial number IV, VI, IX should be submitted on e-stamp paper. The firm claimed that as per its knowledge, M/s Chaudhary Brothers and M/s Safdar Ali & Brothers did not attach e-stamp paper with the bid at the time of submission. The firm claimed that these firms provided their e stamp papers after the closing time for the submission of bid, that are also not notarized. The firm requested to reverify

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore
18-11-2023 & 21.11.2023

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



these e-stamp paper. The firm then stated that as per eligible criteria, if any bidder fulfills the part a mandatory parameter shell only be considered for evaluation.

Decision:

Mr. Shahzad, Proprietor of M/S Allied & Co. pleaded the case of firm before the grievances committee. Mr. Safdar Ali Proprietor of M/S Safdar Ali & Brothers and Mr. Sarwar Proprietor of M/S Chaudhary Brothers defended their cases on behalf of their firms. The petitioner stated its above-mentioned allegations without showing any concrete evidence. The contracts department staff briefed that these firms at later stage submitted affidavits for clause VI of Part-A - for which only undertaking was required- that had never been the part of bid at the time of evaluation. The committee observed that the section IV of evaluation criteria Part-A read with clause 1.2 of Instructions to bidders shall be on stamp paper, and section IX also requires undertaking on stamp paper. However, section VI does not require undertaking on stamp paper. The committee examined the bids and found that the requisite stamp papers and declaration are already in the bids of both defendants. The submitted affidavits were also shown to the committee that were not part of bid. **The committee unanimously decided to turn down the grievance submitted by M/S Allied & Co. and upheld the decision of Technical Evaluation Committee.**

ITEM NO. 02:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S SAAD ENTERPRISES(TENDER FOR CONTRACT OF NURSING HOSTEL CANTEEN & EYE WARD CANTEEN)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted the grievance that it participated in above subject tender and has grievance against the final technical report on the announced on 30/10/2023. The firm stated that it is non-responsive due to failure in eligible criteria part A mandatory parameter serial number viii part A Sr. No. Viii, as Punjab Food Authority License shows different NIC on QR scanning code. The firm claimed that it has provided a valid PFA license issued by the Punjab Food Authority & the QR Code scanning is not firm's mistake. The firm further stated that it is aware of this fault and will correct it from Punjab

(Handwritten signatures and initials)

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore
18-11-2023 & 21.11.2023

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



Food Authority. The firm requested that verify food license by QR scanning code and after verification, accept its grievance & declare it responsive.

Decision:

Mr. Khurram Shehzad pleaded the case of firm before the grievances committee. The firm's representative claimed that the discrepancy was at the part of PFA and showed updated PFA License No. LHR/EAT-B/37068912 valid w.e.f 19.11.2023 to 30.06.2024. The firm further showed previous license No. LHR/EAT-B/37068912 valid w.e.f 19.11.2022 to 18.11.2023 bearing same CNIC No.35201-1651940-3& Name Khurram Shehzad. However, the CNICno. was different in the barcode at that time but the rest of credentials were same in the barcode. The committee scanned both barcodes of previous and new license and found that credentials have been updated and are same on both barcodes. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clauseVIII of Part-A: Mandatory Parameters.**

ITEM NO. 03:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S CHAIDHARY BROTHERS(TENDER FOR CONTRACT OF NURSING HOSTEL CANTEEN & EYE WARD CANTEEN)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted the grievance that it participated in the tender of canteens and announced as responsive but firm has some reservations on the report of the technical announced on 30-10-2023 that are as follows;

1. M/s. Allied & Co has no professional certificate/CV/Courses as this firm has no any qualified employees / staff.
2. M/s. Allied & Co has limited working experience for managing canteens.
3. M/s. Allied & Co has bad experience with KEMU due to which KEMU management has issued warning / show cause lettersi.e. No. 25/437/BH, dated 13.08.2021 regarding unsatisfactory cleanliness, No. 20/250/2022, dated 19.03.2022 regarding Show Cause Notice&No. 20/579/2022, dated 16.11.2021 regarding Warning Letter for poor performance.
4. M/s. Allied & Co has weak Bank Statement.

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore
18-11-2023& 21.11.2023

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



5. M/s. Allied & Co firm goodwill & reputation is not up to mark.
6. M/s. Allied & Co submitted ISO 9001:2015 which is issued for the Medicine, Medical Equipment and Medical Devices.
7. M/s. Allied & Co submitted ISO 22000:2018 which is issued for the Medicine Suppliers, Services.
8. M/s. Allied & Co is defaulter of the Mayo Hospital Lahore as it is not submitting approx. 20 million bid money of his past contracts. According to the bidding documents the defaulter firm cannot participate in the tender.

Decision:

Mr. Sarwar Proprietor of M/S Chaudhary Brothers pleaded the case of firm before the grievances committee. Mr. Shahzad, Proprietor of M/S Allied & Co. defended the case of firm before the grievances committee. The petitioner presented the alleged claims stated in the grievance. The defendant showed professional Tax certificate issued on 13.07.2023 from its bid. The defendant then claimed that it has sufficient working experience in managing canteens and presented experience certificates from the bid issued by Medical Superintendents of Mayo Hospital Lahore for the period from 2012 to 2018 and 2020 to 2022. The committee observed that the TEC has awarded 15 marks in this section that are tenable. The defendant further claimed that its firm has not been blacklisted and merely issuance of show cause notices does not violate any TOR of bidding document including evaluation criteria. The defendant further claimed that its bank statement attached in the bid is sufficient to qualify the requirements of evaluation criteria and showed Bank Statement for the last 3 years that stands at Rs. 131 million. The defendant further showed ISO 9001:2015 & ISO 22000:2018 certificates where Food category is also mentioned. The defendant lastly claimed that petitioner alleged claim regarding bid money does not pertain to any clause of bidding document. **The committee unanimously decided to turn down the grievance of M/S Chaudhary Brothers against M/S Allied &**

Co.

Department of Neurology, Mayo Hospital Lahore
18-11-2023 & 21.11.2023

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and by the Chair.

Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Mr. Azeem Butt
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Sohail Arshad
Addl. Director Stores
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary
HoD Ophthalmology Department
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Prof. Dr. Ahsan Numan
HoD Neurology Department
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Upload as per policy