MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

Participants:

1.	**Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary** Head of Ophthalmology Department Unit-II Mayo Hospital Lahore	**Chairman**
2.	**Dr. Umar Nazir** *Assistant Professor of Plastic Surgery Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
3.	**Dr. Sana Farooq** *Senior Registrar Neurology Department Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
4.	**Mr. Azeem Butt** *Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**
5.	**Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti** *Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore*	**Member**

Proceedings:

Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairman, Grievances Committee Mayo Hospital Lahore welcomed all the participants.

ITEM NO. 01: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S KAUMEDEX (TENDER: A013 DISPOSABLE SYRINGES/ IV CANULA)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that the firm participated in the said tender and all quoted items were declared non-responsive. The firm claimed that it is the sole agent of its principal in Pakistan JR Engineering & Medical Technologies (M) Sdn Bhd, Malaysia which is a reputable manufacturer of gloves. Th efirm claimed to attach a copy of the Authority letter for participating in tender at Mayo Hospital, Lahore.

Decision: Mr. Ali Raza, Director Sales of M/S Kaumedex pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Part-A and in sample evaluation. The firm's representative showed an authority letter issued by JR Engineering & Medical technologies Malaysia. The committee decided to **declare bid responsive in (d) of Part-A.** The firm's representative then claimed that the gloves quoted by the firm are FDA approved and demonstrated that the gloves do not tear during wearing. **The committee decided to refer matter for re-evaluation of quoted samples.**

Office of Chairman Grievances Committee, Mayo Hospital Lahore
08-08-2024

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

ITEM NO. 02: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S CLIFTON ENTERPRISES (TENDER: A013 DISPOSABLE SYRINGES/ IV CANULA)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to TE No. 12: Latex Examination Gloves. The bid has been deemed non- responsive due to the absence of an attached authority letter specifically for Mayo Hospital Lahore.

The firm it is a reputable importer with a comprehensive authority letter that encompasses all operations across Pakistan, including those at Mayo Hospital Lahore. The firm claimed that an oversight led to the initial omission of this specific document from bid for which attested authority letter is attached.

Decision: Mr. Qasim, Sales Manager of M/S Clifton Enterprises pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative showed an authority letter issued by Maxter Glove Manufacturing Malaysia. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters.**

ITEM NO. 03: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S HAKIMSONS (TENDER: A013 DISPOSABLE SYRINGES/ IV CANULA)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to Technical Evaluation Report to the extent of Bid Enquiry NO. 7 Microburette that is Non-Responsive due to failure of Point "d" in Part-A. The firm claimed that being exclusive distributor it is allowed to participate in all the tenders throughout Pakistan - the evidence of which was attached with its offer. The firm added that on request it also received separate letter from Manufacturer to participate in Mayo Hospital Lahore tender for the year 2024-25 for which the copy is attached.

Decision: Mr. Abid, Regional Manager of M/S Hakimsons pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative showed an Authority Letter issued by

M/S Ningho MAFLAB Medical Instruments Co. Ltd. China. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters.**

ITEM NO. 04: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S INTRAHEALTH (TENDER: A013 DISPOSABLE SYRINGES/ IV CANULA)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to Technical Evaluation Report regarding Sr. No. 13 Microburette Volumetric chamber for infusion 100 ml with set, min length 150 cm that is approved by DRAP. The firm claimed that its quoted brand Unison is approved in Part B Sample Evaluation but not approved in compliance to Part (A) clause d i.e. Authority letter for participation in tender at Mayo Hospital Lahore. The firm claimed that it is the Sole Agent of principal Weifang Kawa Medical Products Co., Ltd China in Pakistan. The Sole Agency Letter / Authority Letter was provided with the bid and is applicable all over Pakistan including private & government institutions/Hospitals as well for District Health Authority Punjab. The firm also claimed that it is prequalified with DGHS Punjab for the FY 2024-25 with this authority letter.

Grievance against M/s Cardiac Care and M/s Hakimsons.

The firm stated that M/s Cardiac Care quoted for Sr. No. 13 SCM, China" brand and declared non-responsive due to Part (A) clause d, k, l, m, n, o, p, q, r and s. The firm claimed that quoted product of M/s Cardiac Care does not have the market experience after the DRAP registration as product belongs to Medical Devices Schedule-E. Hence the past experience of quoted product before the DRAP registration should not be considered.

The firm also claimed that M/s Hakimsons quoted for Sr. No. 13 "Foyomed, China" brand and declared non-responsive due to Part (A) clause d. The said brand of "Foyomed, China" is approved in Part (A) clause n. of market experience for three financial years. It added that the Microburette was registered as Drug in the year of 2011 and later on it was registered as Medical Device. Therefore, the Medical Device registration is compulsory for this product and only the market experience after the registration as Medical

Device should be considered. Hence, the past experience of quoted product before the DRAP registration should not be considered.

Decision: Mr. Shehryar,Territory Manager of M/S IntraHealth pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters. The firm's representative showed an authority letter issued by Weifang Kawa Medical Products Co. Ltd. China. **The committee decided to declare firm responsive in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters.**

Grievance against M/s Cardiac Care.

The defendant was absent. The committee observed that the firm is already non-responsive.

Grievance against M/s Hakimsons.

Mr. M. Abid, Regional Manager defended the grievance on behalf of M/S Hakimsons. The petitioner stated that although the quoted product of M/S Hakimsons has market experience but does not have three years experience after DRAP registration as a Medical Device. The committee observed that the alleged claim of petitioner is not tenable and regretted the grievance.

ITEM NO. 05: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S LASANI HEALTHCARE (TENDER: A013 DISPOSABLE SYRINGES/ IV CANULA)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance that the firm has been declared "Non Responsive" in Disposable Syringe. 5cc AD Sr No 2 and I.V Cannula SR No. 08,09,10,11 in part A and B by the Technical Evaluation Committee.

Submission regarding Part-A:

The firm stated that it hac recently encountered a policy that mandates the submission of an authority letter for manufacturers to participate in tendering or quoting directly. This requirement presents a significant challenge for the firm and other local manufacturers, as it introduces unnecessary administrative hurdles and potential delays in the procurement

process. The firm claimed that its established credentials, certifications, and past performance should serve as sufficient qualifications for participating in procurement procedures. Requiring an authority letter adds an additional layer of bureaucracy that is not typically necessary for experienced manufacturers who are well-versed in supplying healthcare facilities like Mayo Hospital Lahore. The firm requested a reconsideration of this policy. The firm proposed that Mayo Hospital Lahore shall review its requirements and consider exempting manufacturers from the mandatory submission of an authority letter.

Submission regarding Part-B:

The firm claimed that the submitted samples meet all the technical requirements in the bidding document. The firm claimed that its Product is of utmost quality and has been supplied in the bulk purchase of Surgical Disposable of major hospitals in Punjab and have never received any complaint whatsoever from DTL or End Users. Regardless of all these standards and experience, the samples have been declared "Non-Satisfactory". The firm requested to re-evaluate the decision made by the Technical Evaluation Committee and consider samples in the best interest of Hospital and Public.

Decision:

Mr. Ahmad, Sales Manager of M/S Lasani Healthcare pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) and clause (m) of Compulsory Parameters & failure in sample evaluation. The firm's representative did not provide any document to qualify the requirement of clause (d) & clause (m) of Compulsory Parameters. **The committee decided to uphold the decision of the Technical Evaluation Committee.**

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

ITEM NO. 06: **GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S EASTERN MEDICAL CARE (TENDER: A013 DISPOSABLE SYRINGES/ IV CANULA)**

GRIEVANCE DETAIL: The firm submitted the grievance with reference to the tender of Surgical items The firm claimed that the authorization letter issued by its principal (ASAP International SDN, BHD Malaysia) is already attached with the bid however copy of the same is again enclosed for the reference and approval. Regarding T.E. 14, 15, 16, 17 (Surgical Gloves Latex Sterile (6.5, 7.0, 7.5 & 8.0) & Powder free) the firm claimed that its quoted brand is world leading brand registered from DRAP under registration no. MDIR-0004917. The firm claimed that it mentioned both powder / powder free gloves having same brand in the technical proposal due to clerical mistake. However, it undertakes that it will supply only powder free surgical gloves (ASAP, brand) as per the demand of the hospital if approved by the committee on the same price.

Decision: Mr. Kamran, Managing Director of M/S Eastern Medical Care pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (d) of Compulsory Parameters for all quoted products and failure in part-B due to samples not as per specifications. The firm's representative provided an Authority Letter issued by M/S ASAP International Malaysia issued on 26th April 2024. The committee decided to declare bid responsive in clause (d) of Part-A Compulsory Parameters. The firm then stated that the firm mistakenly mentioned powdered/ powder free Gloves. The committee observed that the firm has mentioned only Powdered in Technical Bid. The committee also observed that the TEC has given observation that the firm only mentioned Powdered Gloves in delivery challan. The committee regretted the firm's request. **The firm was declared responsive in T.E. 12 only.**

MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and by the Chair.

Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Mr. Azeem Butt
Deputy Drugs Controller
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Sana Farooq
Senior Registrar Neurology Dept.
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Umar Nazir
Assistant Professor Plastic Surgery
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Dr. Nasir Chaudhary
HoD Opthalmology Department
Mayo Hospital Lahore

AMS(P) upload As Regular
24/8/21