

# MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

## MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



### **Participants:**

- |  |                 |
|--|-----------------|
| 1. <b>Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary</b><br>Head of Ophthalmology Department Unit-II Mayo Hospital Lahore | <b>Chairman</b> |
| 2. <b>Dr. Umar Nazir</b><br>Assistant Professor of Plastic Surgery Mayo Hospital Lahore              | <b>Member</b>   |
| 3. <b>Dr. Sana Farooq</b><br>Senior Registrar Neurology Department Mayo Hospital Lahore              | <b>Member</b>   |
| 4. <b>Mr. Azeem Butt</b><br>Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore                             | <b>Member</b>   |
| 5. <b>Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti</b><br>Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore                  | <b>Member</b>   |

### **Proceedings:**

Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairman, Grievances Committee Mayo Hospital Lahore welcomed all the participants.

#### **ITEM NO. 01: GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S FATIMA TRADERS (TENDER: A018 GENERAL STORE ITEMS)**

**GRIEVANCE DETAIL:** The firm submitted the grievance with reference to the TEC Report that its bid was marked NON RESPONSIVE in all quoted items due to failure in all parts due to reasons that in Part A = (Institutional performance of bidder reference to quoted product from any Government Institute) Not Attached. In Part B (Other facilities i.e. vehicles and human resource and certificate of satisfactory past performance issued by competent authority of relevant procuring agency for each year or up to 2 years.) not attached and in Part C = (Non-Responsive Low Quality in all products). The firm alleged that the reasons of failure are not justified as it has already attached the required documents with technical bid. The firm claimed that it has already attached the Institutional performance of bidder reference to quoted product from any Government Institute in part A and moreover have attached the (HR documents) and (Transport documents) in part B too, due to which it would have secured 20 marks in section 1 of part B, thus earning 80 marks in part B. The firm also stated that failure in part c is also not justified as the sample

Office of Chairman Grievances Committee, Mayo Hospital Lahore  
08-07-2024

# MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

## MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



provided is best in quality. The firm requested to reconsider its bid and mark it responsive.

**Decision:**

Mr. Abbas Naqvi of M/S Fatima Traders pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (9) of Compulsory parameters. The firm's representative stated that it has attached past performance of Splash Phenyl but TEC has not qualified in clause (9) of Compulsory Parameters. The committee observed that the institution has advertised Phenyl 3-litre perfumed and no relevant performance/ experience is attached in the bid and with grievance letter. The firm's representative also showed a sample of phenyl during grievances committee, but 'Perfumed word' was not mentioned on the sample. The committee further observed that the firm has also not provided any Purchase Order/ performance of advertised specs mentioned in bidding document for T.E. 22, 23 & 24. The firm's representative then stated that he has attached Supply orders from Shaheed Mohterma Benazir Bhutto Institute of Trauma Karachi & Dow University of Health Sciences to supply shopper bags of all sizes. The committee requested the firm to provide Delivery challans or any other document to show that it has supplied the sizes/ specs, mentioned in the bidding document – for which the firm failed to provide any evidence. **The committee decided to keep the firm non-responsive due to failure in clause (9) of Compulsory parameters.**

**ITEM NO. 02:**

**GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S AMJAD ALI (TENDER: A018 GENERAL STORE ITEMS)**

**GRIEVANCE DETAIL:**

The firm submitted the grievance with reference to Technical Evaluation Report of the General Store Items of Mayo Hospital where the bid has been declared Non-Responsive. Regarding Part - A Compulsory Parameter for all categories Sr-9: - Institutional Performance of Bidder Reference to quoted products from any government institution, the firm stated that the required Certificate is attached with grievance letter. Regarding Part -B Technical Evaluation Parameters Sr.01: Company Profile, I. Storage Capacity, II. Other

Office of Chairman Grievances Committee, Mayo Hospital Lahore

08-07-2024



# MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

## MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



Facilities i.e. Vehicles, III. Human Resource, the firm stated that the firm have office situated at 80- Abubakar Block New Garden town Lahore in which there is a separated dedicated Godown for these supplies, The rent agreement of godown is also attached with grievance letter). The firm then stated that the List of Machinery / Vehicles with registration certificates is attached with grievance letter. The Humen Resource List is also attached. Regarding Sr. 03 Certificate of satisfactory past performance issued by competent authority of relevant procuring agency for each year, the firm stated that the required certificate is attached with grievance letter. The firm maintained the stance for samples that for T.E. 1 the firm quoted a branded Soap which is manufactured by Unilever that is a well-known brand in the market and the manufacturer claims its weight written it on its packaging. For T.E. 5 the firm claimed that the brand LCI (Lucky Core Industries) is formerly known as ICI Pakistan Limited. The firm also claimed that the department has approved ICI Pakistan quoted by another firm while LCI is the current brand name. For T.E. 6, 9, 10, 11, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 31, 31, 47 & 57 the firm claimed that it has quoted the best available sample in the market with the request to approve them.

### **Decision:**

Mr. Tahir Mehmood., General Manager of M/S Amjad Ali pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Technical Evaluation Committee has disqualified the bid due to failure in clause (9) of Compulsory Parameters and less marks in Part-B. The firm's representative stated that he has attached Purchase Orders to display institutional performance for T.E. 5, 7, 30 & 31. The committee observed that the firm has attached Advanced Acceptance for Soda Ash 50kg & Bleaching Powder 25kg from M/S Punjab Institute of Cardiology but failed to show any purchase order for the said item. The firm then showed PO No. 3190/22-23(PESD) dated 15<sup>th</sup> April 2023 issued by Punjab Emergency Department for T.E. 30 and PO No. 3193/22-23(PESD) dated 15<sup>th</sup> April 2023. The committee decided to declare T.E. 30 & 31 responsive in clause (9) of Compulsory parameters. Regarding Ordinary Parameters, the firm then stated that it has attached a rent

Office of Chairman Grievances Committee, Mayo Hospital Lahore

08-07-2024

# MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

## MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



agreement with the grievance letter that did not contain details of the godown area. The committee observed that the storage capacity has not been mentioned in the grievance letter and company introduction. The committee observed that the firm has attached a list of Human Resources (but did not provide appointment letters of staff) & vehicles with the grievance letter. The committee observed that TEC has already awarded 5 marks in clause (1) of part-B. The firm provided Performance Certificates issued by the Director Institute of Blood Transfusion Service for contract of General Store Items for the Financial year 2023-24 and 2022-23. The committee awarded 5 marks to firm in clause (3) of Ordinary Parameters. **The bid remains non-responsive due to failure in Compulsory Parameters for all quoted items except T.E. 30 & 31 and failure in Ordinary Parameters for all quoted items by achieving less marks (60 marks).**

*The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and by the Chair.*

**Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti**  
Deputy Drugs Controller  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Mr. Azeem Butt**  
Deputy Drugs Controller  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Dr. Sana Farooq**  
Senior Registrar Neurology Dept.  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Dr. Umar Nazir (Away)**  
Assistant Professor Plastic Surgery  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Dr. Nasir Chaudhary**  
HoD Ophthalmology Department  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

AMS (P)  
upload As per  
20/8/24  
shyam

Office of Chairman Grievances Committee, Mayo Hospital Lahore

08-07-2024

Page 4 of 4