

# MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

## MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



### Participants:

- |  |                 |
|--|-----------------|
| 1. <b>Prof. Dr. Nasir Chaudhary</b><br>Head of Ophthalmology Department Unit-II Mayo Hospital Lahore | <b>Chairman</b> |
| 2. <b>Dr. Umar Nazir</b><br>Assistant Professor of Plastic Surgery Mayo Hospital Lahore              | <b>Member</b>   |
| 3. <b>Mr. Azeem Butt</b><br>Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore                             | <b>Member</b>   |
| 4. <b>Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti</b><br>Deputy Drugs Controller Mayo Hospital Lahore                  | <b>Member</b>   |

### Proceedings:

Meeting started with the recitation from the Holy Quran. The Chairman, Grievances Committee Mayo Hospital Lahore welcomed all the participants.

**ITEM NO. 01: GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S SUNWIN ENTERPRISES (TENDER: A012: SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)**

**GRIEVANCE DETAIL:** The firm submitted the grievance with reference to rejection of its Financial Bid due to reason cited as "Less Bid Security". The firm stated that its CDR No. 06910870 dated 15.05.2023 amounting to Rs. 160,273/- is already submitted with Tender Documents but due to some clerical mistakes of its office, the CDR is 20/- (Twenty only) Rupees less than the actual CDR requirement that is Rs. 160293/-. The firm submitted an additional CDR No, 07781183 Dated 16-01-2024 amounting to Rs.50/- attached with its this letter. The firm added that its Technical Bid is responsive in all technical Parameters. The firm requested to accept its additional CDR and make its Financial Bid status as "Responsive".

### Decision:

Mr. Ameer Ali, Managing Director of M/S Sunwin Enterprises pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Tender & Purchase Committee has disqualified the bid due to less bid security. The firm representative admitted that its representative mistakenly submitted the less bid security. The committee unanimously decided to uphold the decision of the Tender & Purchase Committee.

Office of Chief Executive Officer, Mayo Hospital Lahore

27-01-2024

# MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

## MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



ITEM NO. 02:

GRIEVANCE SUBMITTED BY M/S ROYS & ROYS  
INTERNATIONAL(TENDER: A012: SURGICAL DISPOSABLE ITEMS)

GRIEVANCE DETAIL:

The firm submitted the grievance that the firm participated in the subject tender in Mayo hospital, Lahore. After thorough evaluation of bidding documents and samples, Technical Assessment Committee (TAC) declared bid responsive for TE No. 3,8,26,27,28,54,110 in Part-A, Part-B, and part-C, while T.E No. 68 (Methylated Spirit) was declared Responsive after review by review committee. The firm added that T.E No.6,7,9,10,46,57,58,62,63,72,73,74,89,90,91,93,104,105,112, 113 were declared responsive in part B and part C, but not in part A as Cheque was attached rather than CDR or Bank guarantee as required under evaluation criteria/bidding document. The firm alleged that it provided clarification during Grievance redressal that its pending payments amount to Rs. 30 Million with Mayo Hospital Lahore, and Cheque is a genuine banking instrument which can be considered as a bid security in prevailing situation, but was not entertained as GRC was of the opinion that it was not mentioned in the bidding document. The firm added that after financial opening the technically accepted items at T.E No. 3,8,26,27,28,54,68,110 have been declared Non-Responsive in financial evaluation report with the reason as "One CDR & One Cheque submitted, less bid security, one person one bid".

The firm claimed that it clearly explained in bidding document through cover letter for 2% bid security that CDR No. 00604917 amounting to rupees 13,11,850/- is attached for TE No. 3,5,8,26,27,28,54,68,110, while Cheque amounting to rupees 1,293,661/- has been attached for T.E No.,6,7,9,10, 46,57, 58, 62,63,72, 73,74,89,90,91,93,104,105,112,113, based on which TAC declared bid responsive for the products for which CDR was attached and non-responsive for products for which cheque was attached.

The firm stated that declaring a firm non-responsive after which have been declared responsive by TAC, G&RC and Review committee is against PPRA

Office of Chief Executive Officer, Mayo Hospital Lahore

27-01-2024

# MINUTES OF GRIEVANCES MEETING

## MAYO HOSPITAL LAHORE



rules and Law and arbitrary because there is no rule under which already qualified items can be declared non-responsive after financial opening and the process will result in shortage of essential medical supplies in Mayo Hospital and causing loss of millions of rupees of public exchequer due to resultant purchase through Local purchase at exuberantly high prices.

The firm requested to accept the financial bid of T.E No. 3,8,26,27,28,54,68,110 which we have been declared responsive by TAC, G&RC and Review committee.

**Decision:**

Dr.Ehsan of M/S Roys & Roys pleaded the case before the grievances committee. The committee observed that the Tender & Purchase Committee has disqualified the bid due to different reasons including the failure to qualify requirement of clause 36A of PPRA Rules 2014 i.e. 'One person one bid'. The committee observed that the firm has attached two different financial offers to its bid. The committee observed that the decision taken by Tender & purchase Committee is justified and unanimously decided to uphold its decision.

*The meeting ended with vote of thanks to and by the Chair.*

**Mr. Muhammad Jawad Bhatti**  
Deputy Drugs Controller  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Mr. Azeem Butt**  
Deputy Drugs Controller  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Dr. Sana Farooq (leave)**  
Senior Registrar Neurology Dept.  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Dr. Umar Nazir**  
Assistant Professor Plastic Surgery  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

**Dr. Nasir Chaudhary**  
HoD Ophthalmology Department  
Mayo Hospital Lahore

Uphold As per  
Policy  
1 AMJC (P)  
2/2/24  
3/1/24

Office of Chief Executive Officer, Mayo Hospital Lahore

27-01-2024